

**Forms of Written Argument: Knowledge, Inquiry and Persuasion.**

"On what grounds can an argument be justified as valid, effective, or successful?" is the fundamental question underlying my selection of readings for this exam. Given the general recognition of the inadequacies of universal criteria of validity based solely on deductive logic, what alternative notions exist for justifying arguments and the claims to knowledge they represent? Is it possible to theorize argumentation without some notion of rationality and what counts as "reasonable" support for a claim? The scholars I have listed take up these questions from positions embodying either relativistic (and/or subjective) or universal (and/or objective) epistemological presuppositions--some try to formulate positions somewhere in between. In addition to the relative/universal dichotomy, cutting across the work of these scholars are distinctions between the interests and problematics traditionally characteristic of divisions among the natural sciences, social sciences, and the humanities. Is it possible to develop a theory of argument that recognizes the intersubjective, dialogical nature of rationality, its situatedness in specific cultural-historical moments (and in different fields of discourse) without taking a completely relativistic position?

Because Habermas has attempted to respond to this last question in great depth, I have included a number of his works as well as responses from his critics. Since Habermas's universalistic claims, and his interest in grounding critical social theory, distinctly challenge poststructuralist and postmodern theory, I have included Derrida, Foucault, and Rorty as representatives of critiques of systematic and totalizing theory. In addition, the tradition of hermeneutics represents a challenge to Habermas's procedural emphasis, and so I have included the work of Gadamer so as to represent an ontological or subjectivistic position -- a different sort of challenge to systematic theory than that of the poststructuralist critiques. Finally, I have included some work in the area of rhetoric and communication studies --fields traditionally concerned with formulating theories of argumentation with an emphasis on audience and persuasion (elements of argumentation distinct from merely the pursuit of objectivity and truth traditionally associated with philosophy). Generally these studies have a relatively under-developed response to the epistemological questions raised by critical theorists and postmodern philosophers, though more recent work attempts a reapproachment of rhetoric and philosophy.

**Primary Texts:**

Derrida, Jacques. "Structure, Sign, and Play in the Discourse of the Human Sciences." The Structuralist Controversy: The Languages of Criticism and the Sciences of Man. Eds. Richard Macksey and Eugenio Donato. John Hopkins UP, 1972: 2-18. [Also in: The Critical Tradition. Ed. David Richter.]

----- "Signature Event Context."

Fish, Stanley. "Is There a Text in This Class?"; "How to Recognize a Poem When You See One"; "What Makes an Interpretation Acceptable?"; and "Demonstration vs. Persuasion: Two Models." in Is There a Text in this Class?. Harvard UP, 1980.

----- "Anti-Foundationalism, Theory Hope, and the Teaching of Composition." in Doing What Comes Naturally.

----- "Rhetoric." in Doing What Comes Naturally.

Foucault, Michel. The Order of Things: An Archeology of the Human Sciences.

- . The Archeaology of Knowledge & The Discourse on Language.
- . "Body/Power"; "Two Lectures"; "Truth and Power"; and "Power and Strategies" in Power/Knowledge. Trans. Colin Gordon.
- Gadamer, Hans-Georg. Truth and Method. 2nd. rev. ed. Continuum, NY: 1994.
- . "On the Scope and Function of Hermeneutical Reflection." Philosophical Hermeneutics. Ed. D. Linge. 1976.
- Habermas, Jurgen. Chapter I. "Introduction: Approaches to the Problem of Rationality"; Chapter III. "Intermediate Reflections: Social Actions, Purposive Activity, and Communication"; in The Theory of Communicative Action. Vol. 1.
- . Chapter V. "The Paradigm Shift in Mead and Durkheim: From Purposive Activity to Communicative Action"; Chapter VI. "Intermediate Reflections: System and Lifeworld." in The Theory of Communicative Action. Vol. 2.
- . Part Two. "Positivism, Pragmatism, Historicism"; Part Three. "Critique as the Unity of Knowledge and Interest"; and Appendix: "Knowledge and Human Interests: A General Perspective" in Knowledge and Human Interests.
- . "What is Universal Pragmatics?" Communication and the Evolution of Society. Beacon Press, 1979.
- . "Reconstruction and Interpretation in the Social Sciences." and "Discourse Ethics: Notes on a Program of Philosophical Justification." in Moral Consciousness and Communicative Action. MIT, 1990.
- . "The Undermining of Western Rationalism through the Critique of Metaphysics: Martin Heidegger;" "The Critique of Reason as an Unmasking of the Human Sciences: Michel Foucault;" and "An alternative Way out of the Philosophy of the Subject: Communicative versus Subject-Centered Reason." The Philosophical Discourse of Modernity. MIT, 1987.
- Kuhn, Thomas. The Structure of Scientific Revolutions.
- Lyotard, Jean-Francois. The Post-Modern Condition: A Report on Knowledge. Minnesota UP: 1984.
- Perelman, Chaim. The Realm of Rhetoric.
- Perelman, Chaim and L. Olbrechts-Tyteca. The New Rhetoric: A Theory of Argumentation. Notre Dame UP: 19xx.
- Rorty, Richard. Philosophy and the Mirror of Nature.
- . "Philosophy as a Kind of Writing: An Essay on Derrida;" "Overcoming the Tradition: Heidegger and Dewey;" and "Pragmatism, Relativism, and Irrationalism." Consequences of Pragmatism. Minnesota UP, 1982.
- Toulmin, Stephen. Uses of Argument.
- . Human Understanding.

## **Secondary Texts:**

- Bazerman, Charles. "Interpretation of Disciplinary Knowledge." Writing the Social Text: Poetics and Politics in Social Science Discourse. Ed. Richard Harvey Brown.
- Bernstein, J.M. Recovering Ethical Life: Jurgen Habermas and the Future of Critical Theory. Routledge, 1995.
- Bialostosky, Don H. "Dialogic, Pragmatic, and Hermeneutic Conversation: Bakhtin, Rorty, and Gadamer." Critical Studies 1 (1989), 107-119.
- Bizzell, Patricia. "What is a Discourse Community?" Academic Discourse and Critical Consciousness. Ed. Patricia Bizzell. Pittsburgh UP, 1992. 202-221.
- Bove, Paul. "The Rationality of Disciplines: The Abstract Understanding of Stephen Toulmin." After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges. Ed. Jonathon Arac. 1988.
- Brown, Richard Harvey. "Symbolic Realism and the Dualism of the Human Sciences: A Rhetorical Reformulation of the Debate between Positivism and Romanticism." The Rhetorical Turn: Invention and Persuasion in the Conduet of Inquiry. Ed. Herbert W. Simons. Chicago UP, 1990.
- Cherwitz, Richard A. and James W. Hikins. Communication and Knowledge: An Investigation in Rhetorical Epistemology. South Carolina UP, 1986.
- Crossewhite, James. The Rhetoric of Reason. Wisconsin UP, 1996.
- Crusius, Timothy W. A Teacher's Introduction to Philosophical Hermeneutics. NCTE, 1991.
- Dallmayr, Fred, and Thomas McCarthy, eds. Understanding and Social Inquiry.
- Dillon, George. Contending Rhetorics. Indiana UP, 19xx.
- Constructing Texts.
- van Eemeren, Frans, and Rob Grootendorst. "Speech Act Conditions as Tools for Reconstructing Argumentative Discourse." Argumentation 3 (1989): 367-383.
- van Eemeren, Frans, Rob Grootendorst, and Francisca Snoeck Henkemans, et al. Fundamentals of Argumentation Theory: A Handbook of Historical Backgrounds and Contemporary Developments. 1996.
- van Eemeren, Frans, Rob Grootendorst, and Tjark Kruijer. The Study of Argumentation. 1984.
- Fraser, Nancy. "Solidarity or Singularity? Richard Rorty between Romanticism and Technocracy." Unruly Practices: Power, Discourse and Gender in Contemporary Social Theory. U Minn P, 1989.
- Grondin, Jean. Introduction to Philosophical Hermeneutics. Yale UP, 1994.
- Hutchings, Kimberly. Kant, Critique, and Politics. Routledge, 1996.
- Ingram, David. Habermas and the Dialectic of Reason. Yale UP, 1987.

- Kent, Thomas. Paralogic Rhetoric: A Theory of Communicative Interaction. Bucknell UP, 1992.
- Kneupper, Charles. "The Tyranny of Logic and the Freedom of Argumentation." Pre/Text 5 (Summer 1983), 113-121.
- McCarthy, Thomas. The Critical Theory of Jurgen Habermas. Polity Press, 1978.
- Meiland, Jack. "Argument as Inquiry and Argument as Persuasion." Argumentation 3 (May 1989): 185-96.
- Meyerson, George. Rhetoric, Reason, and Society: Rationality as Dialogue. Sage, 1994.
- Neel, Jasper. Plato, Derrida, and Writing.
- Norris, Christopher. "Philosophy is Not Just a 'Kind of Writing': Derrida and the Claim of Reason." Redrawing the Lines: Analytic Philosophy, Deconstruction, and Literary Theory. Ed. Reed Way Dasenbrock, Minnesota UP, 1989.
- Olson, Gary A. "Literary Theory, Philosophy of Science, and Persuasive Discourse: Thoughts from a Neo-premodernist." Journal of Advanced Composition 13 (Fall 1993): 283-309.
- Pensky, Max. "Universalism and the Situated Critic." The Cambridge Companion to Habermas. Ed. Stephen K. White. Cambridge UP, 1995.
- Poster, Mark. "The Modern versus the Postmodern." Critical Theory and Poststructuralism: In Search of a Context. Cornell UP, 1989.
- , "Critical Theory and TechnoCulture: Habermas and Baudrillard." The Second Media Age. Polity Press, 1995.
- Ricoeur, Paul. Interpretation Theory: Discourse and the Surplus of Meaning. Texas Christian UP, 1976.
- Rowland, Robert C. "In Defense of Rational Argument: A Pragmatic Justification of Argumentation Theory and Response to the Postmodern Critique." Philosophy and Rhetoric 28 (1995): 350-364.
- Silverman, Hugh, ed. Gadamer and Hermeneutics: Plato, Heidegger, Barthes, Ricoeur, Habermas, Derrida. Routledge, 1991.
- Smith, Christopher. "Toward a Discursive Logic: Gadamer and Toulmin on Inquiry and Argument." The Specter of Relativism: Truth, Dialogue, and Phronesis in Philosophical Hermeneutics. Ed. Laurence Schmidt.
- Stygall, Gail. "Toulmin and the Ethics of Argument Fields: Teaching Writing and Argument." Journal of Advanced Composition 6 (Sp 1987): 93-107.
- Thompson, John B. and David Held. Habermas: Critical Debates.
- Warnick, Barbara and Susan L. Kline. "The New Rhetoric's Argument Schemes: A Rhetorical View of Practical Reasoning." Argumentation and Advocacy 29 (Summer 1992): 1-15.
- Warnke, Georgia. Gadamer, Tradition, and Reason.

- "Hermeneutics and the Social Sciences: A Gadamerian Critique of Rorty." Inquiry 28 (Sept 1985): 343-67.
- "Discourse Ethics and Feminist Dilemmas of Difference." Feminists Read Habermas: Gendering the Subject of Discourse. Ed. Johanna Meehan. Routledge, 1995.
- "Communicative Rationality and Cultural Values." The Cambridge Companion to Habermas. Ed. Stephen K. White. Cambridge UP, 1995.
- Wells, Susan. "Jurgen Habermas, Communicative Competence, and the Teaching of Technical Discourse." Theory in the Classroom. Ed. Cary Nelson.
- Weinsheimer, Joel. Gadamer's Hermeneutic. 1985.
- White, Stephen K. The Recent Work of Jurgen Habermas: Reason, Justice and Modernity. Cambridge, 1988.
- Political Theory and Postmodernism. Cambridge UP, 1991.
- Winspur, Steven. "Text Acts: Recasting Performatives with Wittgenstein and Derrida." Redrawing the Lines: Analytic Philosophy, Deconstruction, and Literary Theory. Ed. Reed Way Dasenbrock, Minnesota UP, 1989.

The Cognitive and Social Force of Metaphor  
and its Contributions to Semantic Innovations in Discourses of Inquiry

My interests in this exam shift from the more philosophical emphasis on argument structures covered in my first exam to a much more closer analysis of properties of language. I have selected the readings for this exam in order to develop a theory of meaning and concept formation that takes account of the fundamental metaphoricity of language. I want to talk about metaphor as a primary means of producing conceptual innovations while at the same time preserving traditional meaning in disciplinary discourses. I want to explore the extent to which the evolution of discourses in fields of inquiry are in some sense dependent on the working out of logical entailments in their dominant metaphors. I have also included conceptions of metaphor that connect meaning with physical and social experiences --realms seen as in some sense existing "outside of" or at least in addition to language-- which I think must be taken into account when contexts of language use (parole) are recognized as influencing the production of meaning as much as is the internal structure of language (langue).

Arrington, Phillip K. "Content(ious) Forms: Trope and the Study of Composition." Farther Along: Transforming Dichotomies in Rhetoric and Composition. Eds. Kate Ronald and Heplizibah Roskelly. Boynton/Cook, 1990. 149-167.

Austin, J.L. How to Do Things with Words. 2nd ed. Harvard UP, 1975.

Barthes, Roland. "The Old Rhetoric: An Aide-memoire." The Semiotic Challenge. Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1988.

Black, Max. "How Metaphors Work." Critical Inquiry 6 (1979): 131.

----. Models and Metaphors.

Booth, Wayne C. "Metaphor as Rhetoric: The Problem of Evaluation." On Metaphor. Ed. Seldon Sacks.

Bourdieu, Pierre. Language and Symbolic Power. Ed. John B. Thompson. Harvard UP, 1991.

Brodkey, Linda. "The Languages in Metaphor." College English 50 (Jan 1988): 89-94.

Burke, Kenneth. "Four Master Tropes." Kenyon Review 3 (1941): 421-38.

Clark, Herbert. "Word Associations and Linguistic Theory." New Horizons in Linguistics. Ed. John Lyons. Penguin, 1970: 271-286.

- Culler, Jonathon. "The Problem of Metaphor." in Language, Meaning and Style. Ed. T.E. Hope, T.B.W. Reid, and Roy Harris.
- . The Pursuit of Signs: Semiotics, Literature, Deconstruction. Cornell, 1981.
- . "Grafts and Graft." On Deconstruction: Theory and Criticism after Structuralism. Cornell, 1982.
- . "Meaning and Iterability." On Deconstruction.
- D'Angelo, Frank J. "Prolegomena to a Rhetoric of Tropes." Rhetoric Review 6 (Fall 1987): 32-40.
- Davidson, Donald. "What Metaphors Mean." Inquiries into Truth and Interpretation. Oxford UP, 1984.
- DeMan, Paul. Part I. "Rhetoric." Allegories of Reading. Yale UP, 1979.
- . "The Epistemology of Metaphor." On Metaphor. Ed. Sheldon Sacks. Chicago UP, 1978.
- Derrida, Jacques. "White Mythology: Metaphor in the Text of Philosophy." Margins of Philosophy. Trans. Alan Bass. Chicago UP, 1982.
- . "Signature Event Context." Margins of Philosophy.
- Dijk, T.A. "Formal Semantics of Metaphorical Discourse." Poetics 4 (19xx): 173-98.
- Dillon, George. Language Processing....
- Fernandiz, James W., ed. Beyond Metaphor: The Theory of Tropes in Anthropology. Stanford UP, 1991.
- Freud, Sigmund. The Interpretation of Dreams.
- Gossens, Louis, et. al., eds. By Word of Mouth: Metaphor, Metonymy and Linguistic Action in a Cognitive Perspective. Benjamins, 1995.
- Halliday, M.A.K. and Ruqaiya Hasan. Chapter 6. "Lexical cohesion." Cohesion in English. Longman, 1976.
- Harris, Roy. Language, Saussure and Wittgenstein: How to Play Games with Words. Routledge, 1988.
- Hollander, John. Melodious Guile: Fictive Pattern in Poetic Language. Yale UP, 1988.

- Jakobson, Roman, and Morris Halle. Fundamentals of Language [specifically, "Two Aspects....."]
- Jensen, J. Vernon. "Metaphor in Argumentation." Rhetoric Society Quarterly 13 (Summer-Fall 1983): 201-207.
- Johnson, Mark. The Body in the Mind.
- , ed. Philosophical Perspectives on Metaphor.
- Kittay, Eva Feder. Metaphor: Its Cognitive Force and Linguistic Structure. Oxford, 1987.
- , and Adrienne Lehrer. "Semantic Fields and the Structure of Metaphor." Studies in Language 5 (1981): 31-63.
- Kristeva, Julie. Section I. "The Semiotic and the Symbolic." Revolution in Poetic Language. Trans. Margaret Waller. Columbia UP, 1984.
- Lacan, Jacques. "Agency of the Letter in the Unconscious," in Ecrits: A Selection. Trans. Alan Sheridan.
- La Capra, Dominick. "Who Rules Metaphor?" Diacritics 10 (1980): 15-28.
- Lakoff, George. "Reflections on Metaphor and Grammar in Honor of Charles J. Fillmore." Essays in Semantics and Pragmatics. Eds. Masagoshi Shibetani, and Sandra Thompson. Benjamins, 1995.
- Lakoff, George and Mark Johnson. Metaphors We Live By.
- . Women, Fire, and Dangerous Things: What Categories Reveal about the Mind. Chicago UP, 1987.
- LeCercle, Jean-Jacques. Chapter 4. "Metaphor." The Violence of Language. Routledge, 1990.
- Levensten, Edward. "Metaphor, Speech Act, and Grammatical Form." Poetics 5 (1976): 383-402.
- Levin, Samuel R. "Two Types of Semantic Widening and Their Relation to Metaphor." Language Topics: Essays in Honour of Michael Halliday I & II. Eds. Ross Steele, and Terry Threadgold. 1987.
- Lyons, John. Chapter 9. "Text and discourse; context and co-text." Linguistic Semantics: An Introduction. Cambridge, 1995.

- Mac Cannell, Juliet Flower. Chapter 5, "The 'Value' of Metaphor." Figuring Lacan. 90-117.
- Moran, Richard. "Seeing and Believing: Metaphor, Image, and Force." Critical Inquiry 16 (Aut 1989): 87-112.
- Nilsen, Don L. "Discourse Tendency: A Study in Extended Tropes." Rhetoric Society Quarterly 19 (Sum 89): 263-272.
- Ortony, A., ed. Metaphor and Thought. Cambridge, 1979.
- Reddy, Michael. "A Semantic Approach to Metaphor." Linguistic Perspectives on Literature. Eds. Marvin K.L. Ching, Michael Haly, and Ronald F. Lunsford. Routledge, 1980. 63-75.
- Richards, I.A. Philosophy of Rhetoric. Oxford, 1936.
- Ricoeur, Paul. The Rule of Metaphor.
- . "The Metaphorical Process of Cognition, Imagination, and Feeling." On Metaphor. Ed. Seldon Sacks.
- Sacks, Seldon, ed. On Metaphor. Chicago UP, 1978.
- Sapir, J. David. "The Anatomy of Metaphor." The Social Use of Metaphor: Essays in the Anthropology of Rhetoric. Eds. J. David Sapir, J. Christopher Crocker. U of Penn P, 1977. 3-32.
- Saussure, Ferdinand. Chapter V. "Syntagmatic relations and associative relations"; Chapter VI. "The language mechanism"; Chapter IV. "Analogy"; and Chapter V. "Analogy and evolution." Course in General Linguistics. Trans. Roy Harris. Eds. Charles Bally and Albert Sechehaye. Open Court, 1986.
- Searle, John R. Expression and Meaning.
- Sweetser, Eve. From Etymology to Pragmatics: Metaphorical and Cultural Aspects of Semantic Structure. Cambridge UP, 1990.
- Traugott, Elizabeth Closs, and Ekkehard Konig. "The Semantics-Pragmatics of Grammaticalization Revisited." Approaches to Grammaticalization. Eds. Elizabeth Closs Traugott and Bernd Heine. Benjamins, 1991. 189-218.
- Wheeler, Samuel. "Metaphor According to Davidson and de Man." Redrawing the Lines: Analytic Philosophy, Deconstruction, and Literary Theory. Ed. Reed Way Dasenbrock. U of Minnesota P, 1989. 116-137.

**Exam #3: Textual Focus/Genre: Feminist Standpoint/The Scholarly Journal Article**

**Theorizing Knowledge from Feminist Standpoints**

I am interested in feminist standpoint theory for its potential for developing a theory of argumentation that not only takes account of critiques of Western rationalism (as poststructuralist and postmodern theory do) but also of how differences in lived experience might affect the production and nature of knowledge. For the purposes of this exam, however, I want to explore the dynamics of discourse formation, using scholarship concerning feminist standpoint theory as a specific site for such an analysis. In doing so, I hope to develop a theory of argument that takes account of discourse dynamics of specific intellectual conversations. For this exam, I intend to identify epistemological presuppositions, dominant metaphors, structures of argument, and modes of critique that underlie this particular conversation in feminist theory as it evolves during the late 1980's and early 1990's. I'm particularly interested in the formation of feminist standpoint theory from positions representative of women of color, and more generally, how standpoint theory responds to postmodernism. I have divided the scholarship into journal and book-length articles because I want to be able to look at how differences in genre influence the form that argumentation takes. For the sake of providing a further genre contrast, I have included some literary works as well.

**Journal or Anthologized Articles:**

Abel, Elizabeth. "Black Writing, White Reading: Race and the Politics of Feminist Interpretation." Critical Inquiry (1993): 470-98.

Alarcon, Norma. "The Theoretical Subject(s) of *This Bridge Called My Back*." Making Face/Making Soul. Ed. Gloria Anzaldua.

Alcoff, Linda. "Cultural Feminism versus Post-structuralism: The Identity Crisis in Feminist Theory." Signs 13 (1988): 405-36.

Anderson, Margaret L., and Patricia Hill Collins. Preface to Race, Class and Gender. Eds. Margaret L. Andersen and Patricia Hill Collins. Wadsworth, 1992.

Benhabib, Seyla. "Epistemologies of Postmodernism." Feminism/Post-modernism. Ed. Linda Nicholson. 107-30.

Bordo, Susan. "Feminisms, Postmodernism, and Gender-Skepticism." Feminism/Postmodernism. Ed. Linda Nicholson. 133-76.

Brown, Wendy. "Postmodern Exposures, Feminist Hesitations." States of Injury: Power and Freedom in Late Modernity. Princeton, 1995.

Code, Lorraine. "Is the Sex of the Knower Epistemologically Significant?" Metaphilosophy 12 (1981): 267-76.

Collins, Patricia Hill. "Learning from the Outsider Within: The Sociological Significance of Black Feminist Thought." Social Problems 33 (1986): S14-S32.

----- "The Social Construction of Black Feminist Thought." Signs 14 (4): 745-73.

----- "Symposium: On West and Fenstermaker's 'Doing Difference.'" Gender & Society 9 (1995): 491-513.

----- "Comment on Hekman's 'Truth and Method: Feminist Standpoint Theory Revisited': Where's the Power?" Signs 22: 375-381.

Cook, Judith A. and Mary Margaret Fonow. "Knowledge and Women's Interests: Issues of Epistemology and Methodology in Feminist Sociological Research." Sociological Quarterly 56 (1986): 2-29.

- Crawford, Mary. "Agreeing to Differ: Feminist Epistemologies and Women's Ways of Knowing." Gender and Thought: Psychological Perspectives. Eds. Mary Crawford and Margaret Gentry. Springer-Verlag, 1989. 128-45.
- De Lauretis, Teresa. "Eccentric Subjects: Feminist Theory and Historical Consciousness." Feminist Studies 16 (1): 116-.
- Di Stefano, Christine. "Dilemmas of Difference: Feminism, Modernity, and Postmodernism." Feminism/Postmodernism. Ed. Linda Nicholson. Routledge, 1990.
- Ebron, Paula, and Anna Lowenhaupt Tsing. "In Dialogue? Reading Across Minority Discourses." Women Writing Culture. Eds. R. Behar and D. Gordon. U of California P, 1995: 390-411.
- Ferguson, Kathy. "Interpretation and Genealogy in Feminism." Signs 16 (2), Winter 1991.
- Flax, Jane. "Political Philosophy and the Patriarchal Unconscious: A Psychoanalytic Perspective on Epistemology and Metaphysics." Discovering Reality. Eds. Sandra Harding and Merrill Hintikka. D. Reidel, 1983. 245-82.
- "The End of Innocence." Feminists Theorize the Political. Eds. Judith Butler, and Joan W. Scott. 1992.
- Fraser, Nancy, and Linda Nicholson. "Social Criticism without Philosophy: An Encounter between Feminism and Postmodernism." Feminism and Postmodernism. Ed. Linda Nicholson. Routledge, 1990.
- Friedman, Susan Stanford. "Beyond White and Other: Relationality and Narratives of Race in Feminist Discourse." Signs 21 (1995): 1-49.
- Garcia, Alam M. "The Development of Chicana Feminist Discourse, 1970-1980." Gender & Society 3 (1989): 217-238.
- Gergen, Kenneth J. "Feminist Critique of Science and the Challenge of Social Epistemology." Feminist Thought and the Structure of Knowledge. Ed. Mary Gergen. New York UP, 1989. 27-48.
- Haraway, Donna. "Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective." Feminist Studies 14 (1988): 575-99.
- "A Manifesto for Cyborgs: Science, Technology and Socialist Feminism in the 1980s." Feminism/Postmodernism. Ed. Linda Nicholson. 190-233.
- "Biological Monsters: xxxxxx"
- Harding, Sandra. "The Instability of the Analytical Categories of Feminist Theory." Signs 11 (1986): 645-64.
- "The Method Question." Hypatia 2 (1987): 19-36.
- "Feminism, Epistemology, and Science." Communication and Cognition 21 (1988): xxx.
- "Feminism, Science, and the Anti-Enlightenment Critiques." Feminism/Postmodernism. Ed. Linda J. Nicholson. Routledge, 1990. 83-106.

- "Who Knows? Identities and Feminist Epistemology." (En)Gendering Knowledge: Feminists in Academe. Eds. Joan E. Hartman, and Ellen Messer-Davidow. 1991.
- "Rethinking Standpoint Epistemology: What is 'Strong Objectivity'?" The Centennial Review. 1993.
- "Subjectivity, Experience, and Knowledge: An Epistemology from/for Rainbow Coalition Politics." Who Can Speak? Authority and Critical Identity. Eds. Judith Roof, and Robyn Wiegman. 1995.
- "Comment on Hekman's 'Truth and Method: Feminist Standpoint Theory Revisited': Whose Standpoint Needs the Regimes of Truth and Reality?" Signs 22: 382-391.
- Hartsock, Nancy. "The Feminist Standpoint: Developing the Ground for a Specifically Feminist Historical Materialism." Discovering Reality: Feminist Perspectives on Epistemology, Metaphysics, Methodology and the Philosophy of Science. Eds. Sandra Harding, and Muriel Hintikka. D. Reidel, 1983. xx.
- "Rethinking Modernism: Minority vs. Majority Theories." Cultural Critique 7: 187-206.
- "Foucault on Power: A Theory for Women?" Postmodernism/Feminism. Ed. Linda Nicholson.
- "Comment on Hekman's 'Truth and Method: Feminist Standpoint Theory Revisited': Truth or Justice?" Signs 22: 367-374.
- Hawkesworth, Mary E. "Feminist Epistemology: A Survey of the Field." Women and Politics 7 (Fall 1987): 115-
- "Knowers, Knowing, Known: Feminist Theory and Claims of Truth." Signs 14 (1989): 533-57.
- Hekman, Susan. "The Feminization of Epistemology: Gender and the Social Sciences." Women and Politics 7 (1987): 65-84.
- "Truth and Method: Feminist Standpoint Theory Revisited." Signs 22: 341-363.
- "Reply to Hartsock, Collins, Harding, and Smith." Signs 22: 399-402.
- Hennessey, Rosemary. "Subjects, Knowledges, . . . and All the Rest: Speaking for What?" Who Can Speak? Authority and Critical Identity. Eds. Judith Roof and Robyn Wiegman. U of Illinois P, 1995. 137-150.
- "Women's Lives/Feminist Knowledge: Feminist Standpoint as Ideology Critique." Hypatia 8.1 (1993): 14-34.
- hooks, bell. "Representing Whiteness in the Black Imagination." ? (1992):
- Jaggar, Alison. "Love and Knowledge: Emotion in Feminist Epistemology." Gender/Body/Knowledge, Eds. Jaggar and Bordo, 1988.
- King, Deborah K. "Multiple Jeopardy, Multiple Consciousness: The Context of a Black Feminist Ideology." Signs 14 (1988):

- King, Kati. "Chapter 2." Theory in Its Feminist Travels.
- Kruks, Sonia. "Identity Politics and Dialectical Reason: Beyond an Epistemology of Provenance." Hypatia 10 (1995): 1-21.
- Longino, Helen E. "Essential Tensions--Phase Two: Feminist, Philosophical, and Social Studies of Science." A Mind of One's Own: Feminist Essays on Reason and Objectivity. Eds. Louise Anthony and Charlotte. Westview, 1992.
- "Review Essay: Feminist Standpoint Theory and the Problems of Knowledge." Signs 19.1 (1993): xx.
- "To See Feelingly: Reason, Passion, and the Dialogue in Feminist Philosophy." Feminisms in the Academy. Eds. Doman C. Stanton, and Abigail J. Stewart. 1995.
- Martin, Jane Roland. "Methodological Essentialism, False Difference, and Other Dangerous Traps." Signs 19 (1994): xxx.
- McDowell, Deborah. "Transferences: Black Feminist Discourse: The 'Practice' of 'Theory.'" Feminism Beside Itself. Eds. Diane Elam, and Robyn Wiegman. 1995.
- Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses." Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism. Eds. Chandra Mohanty, Ann Russo and Lourdes Torres.
- Morawski, Jill. "Impasse in Feminist Thought?" Feminist Thought and the Structures of Knowledge. Ed. Mary Gergen. New York UP. 182-94.
- "Toward the Unimagined: Feminism and Epistemology in Psychology." Making a Difference: Psychology and the Construction of Gender. Eds. Rachel Hare-Mustin and Jeanne Maracek. Yale UP, 1990.
- Moser, Pual K, and J.D. Trout. "What is Feminist Epistemology?" Review article. Informal Logic 17 (1995): 101-111.
- Rose, Hilary. "Hand, Brain, and Heart: A Feminist Epistemology for the Natural Sciences." Signs 9 (1983): 73-90.
- "Reflections on the Debate within Feminist Epistemology." Communication & Cognition 21 (1988): xx.
- Ruddick, Sara. "Review Essay: New Feminist Work on Knowledge, Reason and Objectivity." Hypatia 8.4 (1993): 140-49.
- Sangari, Kumkum. "The Politics of the Possible." The Nature and Context of Minority Discourse. Eds. Abdul R. JanMohamed and David Lloyd. Oxford, 1990.
- Scheman, Naomi. "Undoing Philosophy as a Feminist." Engenderings: Constructions of Knowledge, Authority, and Privilege. 1993.
- "Though This Be Method, Yet There is Madness in It: Paranoia and Liberal Epistemology." A Mind of One's Onw: Feminist Essays on Reason and Objectivity. 1992.

- Sells, Laura. "Review Essay: Feminist Epistemology: Rethinking the Dualisms of Atomic Knowledge." Hypatia 8.3 (1993): 202-210.
- Smith, Dorothy E. Comment on Hekman's 'Truth and Method: Feminist Standpoint Theory Revisited.'" Signs 22: 392-397.
- Smith, Valerie. "Black Feminist Theory and the Representation of the 'Other.'" Changing Our Own Words: Essays on Criticism, Theory, and Writing by Black Women. Ed. Cheryl A. Wall. Rutgers UP, 1989: 38-57.
- Spillers, Hortense. "Notes on an Alternataive Model--Neither/Nor." The Difference Within: Feminism and Critical Theory. Eds. Elizabeth Meese and Alice Parker. John Benjamins, 1989: 165-87.
- Sylvester, Christine. "African and Western Feminisms: World-Traveling the Tendencies and Possibilities." Signs 20 (1995): 941-969.
- Tuana, Nancy. "Review Essay: The Radical Future of Feminist Empiricism." Hypatia 7 (1992): 100-114.
- West, Candace, and Sarah Fenstermaker. "Doing Difference." Gender & Society 9 (1995): 8-37.
- Winant, Terry. "The Feminist Standpoint: A Matter of Language." Hypatia 2 (1987): 123-48.
- Wylie, Alison. "Reasoning about Ourselves: Feminist Methodology in the Social Sciences." Women and Reason. Eds. Elizabeth D. Harvey, and Kathleen Okruhlik. 1992.
- Zita, Jacquelyn N. "Review Essay: A Critical Analysis of Sandra Harding's *The Science Question in Feminism*." Hypatia . (198x): xx. [rpt. in Hypatia 3 (1988). Special issue: "Feminism and Science II." Ed. Nancy Tuana.]

### **Books:**

- Anzaldúa, Gloria. Borderlands/La Frontera. 1987.
- Making Face/Making Soul.
- Belenky, Mary, et. al. Women's Ways of Knowing. 1986.
- Code, Lorraine. What Can She Know? Feminist Theory and the Construction of Knowledge. Indiana UP, 1991.
- Collins, Patricia Hill. Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment. Unwin Hyman, 1990.
- Fonow, Mary Margaret and Judith A. Cook. Beyond Methodology: Feminist Scholarship as Lived Research. Indiana UP.
- Goldberger, Nancy, et al. Knowledge, Difference, and Power: Essays Inspired by Women's Ways of Knowing. 1996.
- Grant, Judith. Fundamental Feminism: Contesting the Core Concepts of Feminist Theory. Routledge, 1993.

- Harding, Sandra. The Science Question in Feminism. Cornell UP, 1985.
- Whose Science? Whose Knowledge: Thinking from Women's Lives. Cornell UP, 1991.
- Harding, Sandra, and Muriel Hintikka, eds. Discovering Reality: Feminist Perspectives on Epistemology, Metaphysics, Methodology, and Philosophy of Science. D. Reidel, 1983.
- Hartsock, Nancy. Money, Sex, and Power. Longman, 1983.
- Hekman, Susan. Gender and Knowledge: Elements of a Postmodern Feminism. 1990.
- hooks, bell. Feminist Theory: From Margin to Center. South End, 1984.
- Talking Back: Thinking Feminist, Thinking Black. South End Press, 1989.
- Hull, Gloria T., Patricia Bell Scott, and Barbara Smith, eds. All the Women Are White, All the Blacks are Men, But Some of Us Are Brave: Black Women's Studies. The Feminist Press, 1982.
- Ruddick, Sara. Maternal Thinking: Toward a Politics of Peace. Beacon, 1989.
- Smith, Dorothy. The Everyday World as Problematic: A Feminist Sociology. Northeastern UP, 1987.
- Texts, Facts, and Fecundity: Exploring the Relations of Ruling. Routledge, 1990.
- The Conceptual Practices of Power: A Feminist Sociology of Knowledge. Northeastern UP, 1990.
- Stanley, Liz, ed. Feminist Praxis: Research, Theory, and Epistemology in Feminist Sociology. Routledge, 1990.
- Stanley, Liz, and Sue Wise. Breaking Out: Feminist Consciousness and Feminist Research. Routledge, 1983.

### *Secondary Readings*

- Butler, Judith. "Against Proper Objects." differences 6.2+3 (1994): 1-26.
- Gender Trouble.
- Bodies that Matter.
- De Lauretis, Teresa. "Upping the Anti(sic) in Feminist Theory." Conflicts in Feminism, Marianne Hirsch, and Evelyn Fox Keller, eds.
- "The Essence of the Triangle or, Taking the Risk of Essentialism Seriously: Feminist Theory in Italy, the U.S., and Britain." the essential difference: Books from differences. Eds. Naomi Schor and Elizabeth Weed. Brown University, 1994.
- Fuss, Diana. Essentially Speaking: Feminism, Nature & Difference. Routledge, 1989.

- Gallop, Jane, et al. "Criticizing Feminist Criticism." Conflicts in Feminism. Eds. Marianne Hirsch and Evelyn Fox Keller. Routledge, 1990: 349-369.
- Gatens, Moira. Feminism & Philosophy: Perspectives in Difference & Equality. Indian UP, 1991.
- Hennessy, Rosemary. Materialist Feminism and the Politics of Discourse. Routledge, 1992.
- Jaggar, Alison. Feminist Politics and Human Nature. Rowman and Allanheld, 1983.
- McDermott, Patrice. Politics and Scholarship: Feminist Academic Journals and the Production of Knowledge. 1994.
- Moi, Toril. Sexual/Textual Politics: Feminist Literary Criticism. Methuen, 1985.
- Schor, Naomi. "French Feminism is a Universalism." differences 7.1 (1995): xx.
- . "This Essentialism Which is Not One." differences 1.2 (1989): 38-58.
- Scott, Joan W. "Deconstructing Equality-versus-Difference." Feminist Studies 14.1 (1988).
- . "Experience." Feminists Theorize the Political. Eds. Judith Butler, and Joan W. Scott. 1992.
- Tong, Rosemarie. Feminist Thought: A Comprehensive Introduction.
- Weeks, Kathi. Marxism Beyond Marxism.
- . Marxism in the Postmodern Age.

**Exam #4: Special Topic Area:**

**Personal Identity, Discourse Diversity, and the Subject of Composition  
in the Multicultural Classroom**

Bakhtin's notions of the dialogic nature of language will provide the theoretical background for my exploration of discourse diversity and its relation to composition in the multicultural classroom. I'm interested in seeing whether his notion of speech genres can be used to distinguish "disciplined discourse" from other forms of discourse with which students are familiar. I want to develop a theory of composition that accounts for the heteroglossic nature of discourses and that explains initiation into academic discourse as a process of learning differences, i.e. how are the combination of utterances and voices that constitute the discourses of "Institutions" different from those that constitute the discourses of "Inclination," of common sense, of home cultures? I want to show that students do have a sense of those differences, but an incomplete one. When Gloria Anzaldua confesses that she is "confused by all the voices that speak to [her] simultaneously," she proclaims what I sense is true for all writers, to a greater or lesser degree depending on background, life experience, race, class, etc. I focus my attention in this exam on scholarship concerning those who inhabit non-dominant discourses (and social positions) and the challenges they encounter when they learn and deploy the discourses of the academy. I will be attempting to answer how the composition course can help students achieve what I see as one goal of education: to know who is speaking/writing the self and how to make choices about the discourses they want to adopt, which ones to hold onto--and the consequences of those choices.

Alcaron, N. "The Theoretical Subject(s) of *This Bridge Called My Back* and Anglo Women." *Making Face, Making Soul*. Ed. G. Anzaldua.

Anzaldua, Gloria. *Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza*. 1987.

Anzaldua, Gloria, ed. *Making Face, Making Soul: Haciendo Caras*. 1990.

Asad, Talal. "The Concept of Cultural Translation in British Social Anthropology." *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*. Ed. James Clifford and Gerge E. Marcus. Berkeley, 1984. 146-62.

Bakhtin, M.M. *Speech Genres and Other Essays*.

----- *The Dialogic Imagination*.

Bartholomae, David. "Inventing the University." *When A Writer Can't Write*. Ed. Mike Rose.

Battaglia, Debhora. "Problematizing the Self: A Thematic Introduction." *Rhetorics of Self-Making*. Ed. Debborra Battaglia.

Berube, Michael, et al. "Guest Column: Four Views on the Place of the Personal in Scholarship." *PMLA* (October 1996).

Bizzell, Patricia. *Academic Discourse and Critical Consciousness*.

----- "Contact Zones and English Studies." *College English* 56 (Feb 1994): 163-69.

Brent, Doug. *Reading as Rhetorical Invention: Knowledge, Persuasion, and the Teaching of Rsearch-Based Writing*. 1992.

- Bridwell-Bowles, Lillian. "Freedom, Form, Function." *College Composition and Communication* 46 (Feb 95): 46-.
- Brodsky, Linda. "Writing on the Bias." *College English* 56 (1994): 527-47.
- "Arguing About Literacy." *Journal of Education* 168 (1986): 47-.
- Bruffee, Kenneth A. "Collaborative Learning and the 'Conversation of Mankind.'" *College English* 46 (Nov 1984): 635-52..
- "Social Construction, Language, and the Authority of Knowledge: A Bibliographic Essay." *College English* 48 (1986): 773-90.
- Campbell, Kermit. "The Signifying Monkey Revisited." *Journal of Advanced Composition* 14 (Fall 1994): 463-.
- Chase, Geoffrey. "Accommodation, Resistance, and the Politics of Student Writing." *College Composition and Communication* 39 (1988): 13-22.
- Chodorow, Nancy. "Toward a Relational Individualism: The Mediation of Self Through Psychoanalysis." *Reconstructing Individualism*. Eds. Thomas C. Heller, et al.
- Clark, Beverly Lyon, and Sonja Wiedenhaupt. "On Blocking and Unblocking Sonja: A Case Study in Two Voices." *College Composition and Communication* 43 (1992): 55-74.
- Clark, Gregory. *Dialogue, Dialectic, and Conversation: A Social Perspective on the Function of Writing*.
- Clifford, John. "The Subject in Discourse." *Contending with Words*. Eds. Harkin and Schilb.
- Crosswhite, James. "Authorship and Individuality: Heideggerian Angles." *Journal of Advanced Composition* 12. 1 (Win 1992): 91-109.
- Darder, Antoina. *Culture and Difference: Critical Actives on the Bicultural Experience in the United States*.
- De, Esha Niyogi and Donna Uthus Gregory. "Decolonizing the Classroom: Freshman Composition in a Multicultural Setting." *Writing in Multicultural Settings*. Eds. Carol Severino, Juan Guerra, and Johnnella Butler. (forthcoming).
- Dean, Terry. "Multicultural Classrooms, Monocultural Teachers." *College Composition and Communication* 40 (1989): 23-37.
- Delpit, Lisa. "The Silenced Dialogue: Power and Pedagogy in Educating Other People's Children." *Harvard Educational Review* 58.3 (1988): 280-98.
- Elbow, Peter. "Reflections on Academic Discourse: How It Relates to Freshmen and Colleagues." *College English* 53 (Feb 1991): 135-55.
- Faigley, Lester. *Fragments of Rationality*. 1992.
- Fox, Tom. "Basic Writing as Cultural Conflict." *Journal of Education* 17.1 (1990): 65-83.
- Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*.

- Freire, Paulo, and D. Macedo. "A Dialogue: Culture, Language, and Race." *Harvard Educational Review* 5 (3): 377-401.
- Gale, Xin Liu. *Teachers, Discourses, and Authority in the Postmodern Composition Classroom*. 1996.
- Geisler, Cheryl. "Exploring Academic Literacy: An Experiment in Composing." *College Composition and Communication* 43 (1992): 39-54.
- Gilyard, Keith. *Voices of the Self: A Study of Language Competence*.
- Giroux, H. "Literacy and the Politics of Difference." *Critical Literacy: Politics, Praxis, and the Postmodern*. Eds. C. Lanshear and P. McLaren.
- *Border Crossings: Cultural Workers and the Politics of Education*. Routledge, 1992.
- Green, Maxine. "Foreward." *Stories Lives Tell: Narrative and Dialogue in Education*. Eds. Carol Witherall and Nell Noddings. 1991.
- Guerra, Juan. "The Place of Intercultural Literacy in the Writing Classroom." *Writing in Multicultural Settings*. Eds. Carol Severino, Juan Guerra, and Johnella Butler. (forthcoming).
- "By Any Means Necessary!: Dialogical Theory, Performance, and the Humanities/Social Science Classroom."
- Heath, Shirley Brice. *Ways with Words*.
- Henderson, Mae Gendolyn. "Speaking in Tongues: Dialogics, Dialectics, and the Black Woman Writer's Literary Tradition." *Reading Black, Reading Feminist*. Ed. Henry Louis Gates.
- Hesford, Wendy S. "Writing Identities: The Essence of Difference in Multicultural Classrooms." *Writing in Multicultural Settings*. Eds. Carol Severino, Juan Guerra, and Johnella Butler. (forthcoming).
- Higginbotham, Evelyn Brooks. "African-American Women's History and the Metalanguage of Race." *Signs* 17.2 (1992): 251-74.
- Hirsch, E.D. *Cultural Literacy*.
- JanMohamed, Abdul R. and David Lloyd. "Introduction: Toward a Theory of Minority Discourse: What Is To Be Done?" *The Nature and Context of Minority Discourse*. Eds. Abdul R. JanMohamed and David Lloyd.
- Knoblauch, C.H. and Lil Brannon. *Critical Teaching and the Idea of Literacy*.
- Lankshire, C. and P. McLaren, eds. *Critical Literacy: Politics, Praxis, and the Postmodern*. 1993.
- Lu, Min-Zhan. "Conflict and Struggle: The Enemies or Preconditions of Basic Writing." *College English* 54 (1992): 887-913.
- "From Silence to Words: Writing as Struggle." *College English* 49 (1987): 433-448.

- Luhmann, Niklas. "The Individuality of the Individual: Historical Meanings and Contemporary Problems." *Reconstructing Individualism*. Eds. Thomas C. Heller, et al.
- Macedo, Donaldo. *Literacies of Power*. 1994.
- McLaren, Peter. "Border Disputes: Multicultural Narrative, Identity Formation, and Critical Pedagogy in Postmodern America." *Naming Silenced Lives*. Eds. D. McLaughlin and W. Tierney. 201-236.
- "Multiculturalism and the Postmodern Critique: Toward a Pedagogy of Resistance and Transformation." *Between Borders*. Eds. Henry Giroux and Peter McLaren. 1994.
- Miller, Richard. "The Nervous System." *College English* (March 1996).
- "Fault Lines in the Contact Zone." *College English* (April 1994).
- "Bringing the Classroom into the Literacy Debate." *Writing Instructor* 11 (Fall 1991): 23-.
- Miller, Suzanne M., and Barbara McCaskill, eds. *Multicultural Literature and Literacies: Making Space for Difference*. 1993.
- Mohanty, Chandra. "On Race and Voice: Challenges for Liberal Education in the 1990s." *Between Borders*. Eds. Giroux and McLaren.
- Mohanty, S.P. "Us and Them: On the Philosophical Bases of Political Criticism." *Yale Journal of Criticism* 2.2 (1989): 1-31.
- Murtadha, K. "An African-Centered Pedagogy in dialog with Liberatory Multiculturalism." *Multicultural education, Critical Pedagogy, and the Politics of Difference*. 1995. 349-370.
- Ogbu, J. "Understanding Cultural Diversity and Learning." *Educational Researcher* 21.8. 5-14.
- Peim, N. *Critical Theory and the English Teacher: Transforming the Subject*. 1993.
- Pratt, Mary Louis. "Arts of the Contact Zone." *Profession* 91 (1991): 33-40.
- Ritchie, Joy. "Beginning Writers: Diverse Voices and Individual Identity." *College Composition and Communication* 40 (1989): 152-74.
- Rodriguez, Richard. *Hunger for Memory*.
- Roof, Judith, and Robyn Wiegman, eds. *Who Can Speak? Authority and Critical Discourse*.
- Rose, Mike. *Lives on the Boundaries*.
- Saldívar, Ramon. *Chicano Narrative: The Dialectics of Difference*.
- Saville-Troike, Muriel. *The Ethnography of Communication*. 1982.
- Severino, Carol. "Where the Cultures of Basic Writers and Academia Intersect: Cultivating the Common Ground." *Journal of Basic Writing* 2 (1992): 4-15.

- Smith, Sidonie. "Who's Talking/Who's Talking Back? The Subject of Personal Narrative." *Signs* 18 (Winter 1993): 392-407.
- Spellmeyer, Kurt. *Common Ground: Dialogue, Understanding, and the Teaching of Composition*.
- Spivak, G. *Outside in the Teaching Machine*. 1993.
- Street, Brian, ed. *Cross-Cultural Approaches to Literacy*. 1993.
- Stivers, Camilla. "Reflections on the Role of Personal Narrative in Social Science." *Signs* 18 (Winter 1993): 408-25.
- Takaki, R. *A Different Mirror*. 1993.
- Valdes, Guadalupe. "Bilingual Minorities and Language Issues in Writing." *Written Communication* 9 (1992): 85-136.
- Villanueva, Victor, Jr. *Bootstraps: From an American Academic of Color*.